



FAMILY LAW

Cases and Materials

Volume I

Carol Rogerson and Martha Shaffer
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

1993-1994

Prepared with the assistance of Ranald Sinclair and Ella Schwartz

* * *

*These materials are distributed solely for classroom use
by students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto*

100
100
100

AUG 25 1993
DORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
AUG 30 1993
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FAMILY LAW

Cases and Materials

Volume I


Carol Rogerson and Martha Shaffer
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

1993-1994

Prepared with the assistance of Ranald Sinclair and Ella Schwartz

* * *

*These materials are distributed solely for classroom use
by students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto*



Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

FAMILY LAW

Table of Contents

Volume I

Page No.

I. INTRODUCTION: THE FAMILY AND FAMILY LAW

A. The Family: Definitions and Demographics

Excerpts from Statutes and International Documents	1
Note: Constitutional protection for the Family in Canada	3
<i>MacLean's</i> , "Strong Family Ties"	4
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Family top source of pleasure"	5
Barrett and McIntosh, <i>The Anti-Social Family</i>	6
Thorne, <i>Rethinking the Family: Some Feminist Questions</i>	8
Eichler, <i>Families in Canada Today</i>	10
<i>Transition</i> , "The family in Canada"	26
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Changing family unit will challenge judges, industry"	28
Boyd, "Changing Canadian Family Forms"	30

B. Domestic Violence: The Dark Side of Families

Eichler, <i>Families in Canada Today</i>	40
Johnson and Chisholm, "Family Homicide"	43
Lupri, "Male Violence in the Home"	44
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Relatives biggest killers of children"	46
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "The twists and turns in family ties"	47
Drakich and Guberman, "Violence in the Family"	48
MacLeod, <i>Battered But Not Beaten</i>	54
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Laying charges saves wives"	59
<i>Toronto Star</i> , "Justice system still full of pitfalls for abused women"	60
<i>Toronto Star</i> , "Calgary police took 21 minutes to heed rape victim's call"	63
<i>Hyldtoft v. Hyldtoft</i>	64
<i>Lawyer's Weekly</i> , "Family violence is manifestation of male power in society: Wilson"	65
<i>Edmonton Journal v. A.G. Alta.</i>	66
<i>R. v. Lavallee</i>	67
<i>L.(A.) v. Crimes Compensation Board (Sask.)</i> , <i>Lawyer's Weekly</i>	77

Freeman, <i>the Rights and Wrongs of Children</i>	78
<i>Criminal Code</i> , s. 43	83
<i>Toronto Star</i> , "Spanking was too harsh"	83
<i>R. v. Baptiste</i>	84
Drakich and Guberman, "Violence in the Family"	86
<i>B. (A.) v. J. (I.) (Lawyer's Weekly)</i>	89

C. Legal Regulation of the Family

<i>Balfour v. Balfour</i>	90
<i>Catholic Children's Aid Society of Metropolitan</i> <i>Toronto v. T.S.</i>	92
Wald, "Introduction" to "Symposium: The Family, the State and the Law"	96
Olsen, "The Family and the Market"	98
Minow, "Beyond State Intervention in the Family"	108
Eekelaar, <i>Family Law and Social Policy</i>	112
Glendon, <i>Abortion and Divorce in Western Law</i>	120

II. MARRIAGE AND NULLITY

A. The Significance of Marriage

Vanier Institute, <i>Canadian Families</i>	122
Cox, "Alternative Families"	125
Freeman, discussion of <i>Sefton Holdings v. Cairns</i>	127
Law Reform Commission of Canada, <i>Bigamy</i>	128
<i>Hyde v. Hyde</i>	128
<i>Graham v. Graham</i>	129
Day, "The Charter and Family Law"	132
Note: Significance of Marriage for Indian Women	134
Glendon, "The New Marriage and the New Property"	135
<i>R. v. Duvivier</i>	143
<i>R. v. Salituro</i>	146

B. Validity of Marriage

(a) Overview

Hahlo, "Nullity of Marriage in Canada"	148
McLeod, "Validity of Marriage" from <i>Introduction to Family Law</i>	150

(b) Monogamy

Law Reform Commission of Canada, <i>Bigamy</i>	156
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Scads of Spouses"	158
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Community practises polygamy"	158
Note: Serial Monogamy	160

(c) Capacity to Consummate

<i>Gajamugan v. Gajamugan</i>	161
<i>Dashevsky v. Dashevsky</i>	164
<i>Harthan v. Harthan</i>	166
<i>Norman v. Norman</i>	169

(d) Opposite Sexes

<i>Corbett v. Corbett</i>	171
<i>Lawyer's Weekly</i> , "Transsexual loses fight for change to birth certificate"	173
<i>B. v. A.</i>	174
<i>Anderson v. Luoma</i>	181
<i>Layland and Beaulne v. Ontario</i>	184
<i>Re Andrews</i>	194
<i>Knodel v. British Columbia Medical Services Commission</i>	195
<i>Veysey v. Canada (Correction Services)</i>	196
<i>Leshner v. Ontario</i>	196
<i>Toronto Star</i> , "NDP faces battle over gay rights"	198
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Blue Cross plans appeal of ruling on spousal benefits"	199
<i>Egan and North v. Canada</i>	200
<i>Mossop v. Canada</i>	202
Note: <i>Braschi v. Stahl</i>	208
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Denmark allows homosexual marriage"	209
Note: The "Registered Partnership in Denmark" Law, "Homosexuality and the Social Meaning of Gender"	210
Duclos, "An Argument for Legal Recognition of Same Sex Marriage"	211

(e) Consent

McLeod, <i>Introduction to Family Law</i>	214
<i>Asser v. Peermohamed</i>	219
<i>Singla v. Singla</i>	224
<i>Truong (Malia) v. Malia</i>	228
Note: Treatment of Marriage under the Immigration Act	229
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Marriages of convenience out for immigrants"	229

C. Unmarried Cohabitation

<i>Women in Canada: A Statistical Report</i> , "Common-law unions"	230
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Common-law living on rise"	231
Institute of Law Research and Reform, <i>Survey of Adult Living Arrangements</i> , "Summary of reasons for cohabiting"	232
O'Donovan, "Legal Marriage - Who Needs It?"	233
Glendon, <i>The Transformation of Family Law</i> , "Informal Family Relations"	238
Note: The Legislative Treatment of Unmarried Couples	242
<i>Molodowich v. Penttinen</i>	244
<i>Stoikiewicz v. Filas</i>	252
<i>Re Labbe and McCullough</i>	254
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Yolanda Ballard seeking \$16,050 a month"	256
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Yolanda Ballard gets \$7,000 a month"	257
<i>Toronto Star</i> , "Ottawa gives up on persecuting Olive"	258
Leighton, "Handmaids' Tales: Family Benefits Assistance and the Single-Mother-Led Family"	260
Note: Subsequent Amendments to the FBA Regulations	263

III. DIVORCE**A. The Social Context of Divorce**

Adams, "Divorce Rates in Canada"	264
Dept. of Justice, <i>Evaluation of the Divorce Act</i>	265
Payne, "The Dichotomy between Family Law and Family Crisis on Marriage Breakdown"	270

<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Marital Upheaval"	273
Richardson, "Children of Divorce"	274

B. Reform of Divorce Law

(a) Movement to No-Fault Divorce

Hahlo, "The Changing Face of Marriage and Divorce"	281
Abella, "Opening Address" in Sloss, ed., <i>Family Law</i> in <i>Canada</i>	285
Bissett-Johnson and Day, <i>The New Divorce Act</i>	289
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "A History of Divorce"	293
Collins, "On Canadian Public Policy-Makers" in <i>The Big Evasion</i>	294
Dept. of Justice, <i>Evaluation of the Divorce Act</i> , "Background and Evaluation Issues"	295
Dept. of Justice, <i>Evaluation of the Divorce Act</i> , "Reducing the Adversarial Process"	304

(b) Critiques of No-Fault Divorce

R.E.A.L. Women, "Easy Divorce?"	306
Amiel, "The Fault in No-Fault Divorce"	308
Weitzman, "Divorce and the Illusion of Equality"	309
Melli, "Constructing a Social Problem: The Post-Divorce Plight of Women and Children"	315

(c) Grounds for Divorce

(i) Living Separate and Apart

<i>Rushton v. Rushton</i>	316
<i>Dupere v. Dupere</i>	317
Note: "Relevance of Date of Separation for Property Division under the <i>Family Law Act</i> "	319

(ii) Adultery

Bissett-Johnson and Day, <i>The New Divorce Law</i> , "definition of Adultery"	321
Glendon, <i>The Transformation of Family Law</i>	322
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Wisconsin woman to stand trial on rarely used adultery charge"	323
<i>Lawyer's Weekly</i> , re Brazilian defence of honour	324

	<i>Masterlerz v. Garland</i>	325
	<i>Davenport v. Miller</i>	328
	<i>Orford v. Orford</i>	332
	<i>MacLennan v. MacLennan</i>	334
(iii)	<u>Cruelty</u>	
	<i>Knoll v. Knoll</i>	337
	<i>Austin v. Austin</i>	340
	<i>Gilbert v. Gilbert</i>	341
	<i>B.(Y.) v. B.(J.)</i>	345
	<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Putting the 'fault' back in no-fault divorce"	347
	<i>Lawyer's Weekly</i> , "Spousal misconduct returns to divorce?"	348
	<i>Lawyer's Weekly</i> , "Battered woman wins suit"	351
(d)	<u>Bars to Proceedings</u>	
(i)	<u>Condonation, Connivance, Collusion</u>	
	Davies, <i>Family Law in Canada</i> , "Condonation"	352
	<i>Guglielmo v. Mikhail (Lawyer's Weekly)</i>	354
	Davies, <i>Family Law in Canada</i> , "Connivance" and "Collusion"	355
(ii)	<u>Inadequate Provision for Child Support</u>	
	<i>R.D.F. v. S.L.F.</i>	358
	Note: <i>MacKinnon, Bergman, Schultz, Simpson</i>	361
	Note: <i>Harper v. Harper</i>	363
(iii)	<u>Removal of Barriers to Religious Divorce</u>	
	<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "The ties that continue to bind"	364
	<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Religious laws to be removed as 'bargaining chip' in divorces"	366
C.	Institutional Reforms: The Process of Divorce	
(a)	<u>Unified Family Court</u>	
	Zuber Commission, "Report of the Ontario Courts Inquiry"	367
	Hanna, "The Rush for Court Reform"	379

<i>Lawyer's Weekly</i> , "Single 'supercourt' is reform scheme's goal"	382
<i>Matrimonial Affairs</i> , "Court Reform"	384

(b) Mediation

Landau, "Mediation: An Option for Divorcing Families"	385
Woods, "Mediation: A Backlash to Women's Progress on Family Law Issues"	394
Payne and Overend, "Divorce Mediation: An Overview of Process and Strategies"	397
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Even for battered wives mediation is endorsed as an option in divorce"	409

IV. THE ECONOMICS OF MARRIAGE BREAKDOWN

A. The Economics of Marriage

Moller Okin, <i>Justice, Gender and the Family</i>	410
Armstrong and Armstrong, "Woman, Family and Economy"	412
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Women sacrifice career plans for family"	416
Gunderson, <i>Women and Labour Market Poverty</i>	417
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Study finds chores not shared"	420

B. The Economic Consequences of Divorce

Rogerson, "Winning the Battle, Losing the War"	421
Weitzman, "The Economics of Divorce"	431
National Council of Welfare, <i>Women and Poverty Revisited</i>	432
Dept. of Justice, <i>Evaluation of the Divorce Act</i>	451
<i>Lawyer's Weekly</i> , "Family law reform can't solve divorce poverty?"	456

